Discourse Analysis of the Book of Titus

By Corey Keating

Professor Tom Parker
Directed Study: Advanced Greek – Term Paper
Fuller Theological Seminary
Phoenix Extension
Winter Quarter 2003
The New Testament epistle of Titus exhibits a fascinating syntactical structure in its original language, Koine Greek. Does that syntactical structure correspond to the semantic force of the letter? Does the syntax convey the same emphasis as the overall message of the discourse? If not, where do they differ or intersect? It will be argued here that the major thrust of the book syntactically is parenetic in nature; it emphasizes Paul’s exhortation for Titus to teach sound doctrine and to live a life worthy of that gospel message. What could be considered as the more profound theological points are syntactically subordinate to these imperatival exhortations. However, regarding discourse and semantics, the content of what Titus is to teach and the outcome it should have on his hearers carries the most weight. Thus from a semantic viewpoint, the letter has strong ethical overtones. The message of the letter for Titus is to preach and teach. The message of the letter for others in the church is that their lives should exhibit good works so as to confirm the sound doctrine of the gospel message.

It is not my intention here to give a detailed outline of the book of Titus, but rather to point out the syntactical and discourse features that give structure to the letter. But in highlighting the patterns of discourse and the syntactical boundary markers, an overall outline of the book does become apparent.

For purposes of this paper, I am taking the letter’s introduction at face value and assuming that the Apostle Paul originally wrote the book as a letter to his younger co-worker, Titus, whom he had left on the island of Crete. Although this is not critical for the argument of this paper, it facilitates a less awkward way of referring to the writer and recipient. Furthermore, I am only dealing with the book in its final form, assuming that it was written as one coherent letter and not subsequently collected from various writings. Moreover, I am not considering the impact that textual variants may have on the letter’s meaning or structure.
High Level Structural Elements
A New Testament Epistle

Structurally the book of Titus fits the typical tripartite form of most New Testament epistles, having an introductory salutation, a letter body, and a closure.¹ Like most epistles, Paul’s opening salutation to Titus (1:1-4) is characterized by its “lack of finite verbal forms.”² (It should be noted that there are indeed two finite verbs in Titus 1:1-4, but they are both in subordinate relative clauses. There is no explicit verb forming an independent clause in these first four verses. In this regard the first four verses are verbless.)

The body of the letter thus starts with the first explicit independent verbal clause in Titus 1:5. It ends with the last formal instruction given to Titus in chapter 3, verses 10 and 11. Most of this paper will discuss the material within this section.

The last four verses of the book (3:12-15) are set apart as the closing section. Structurally they are separated from the body of the letter by the subordinating conjunction ὅταν (“when”), which puts the temporal deixis into the future. Semantically the topic changes to closing instructions and final blessings.

Structured According to Time

Seen from a different level of overall structure, it is interesting to note the time element in different sections of this letter. After the opening, the body of the letter first talks about actions that took place in the past. It then gives directives concerning Titus’ present situation and concludes by giving instructions regarding the future.

The first verb in the body of the letter is ἀπέλαλπον (“I left”), which is in the aorist tense. The context helps to clarify the fact that this is a normal use of the aorist indicative, referring to an

² Ibid., 83.
action in the past time. In this section, Paul reminds Titus why he had left him in Crete. He subsequently sent him this letter for exhortation and encouragement.

In verse thirteen, Paul then uses the first imperative verb in this letter. At this point the discussion turns from why Titus had been left in Crete to his current assignment and responsibilities in that location. All the imperatives used in the body of the letter are in the present tense. The discussion throughout the entire body of the letter revolves around present instructions for Titus.

As mentioned above, the closing section of the letter begins with the subordinating conjunction ὅταν (“when”), which puts the time of the statement into the future. This shift to future time acts as a syntactical boundary. Besides the final greeting, the conclusion to the letter is mainly instructions concerning the future for both Titus and those with him.

**Syntactical Boundaries and Patterns in Letter’s Structure**

**Overview of the Structure**

A syntactic analysis of the main body of Titus’ letter reveals some intriguing patterns of discourse. (Refer to the “Structural Outline” below for a visual representation of this material.) It seems that most new sections of discourse begin with exhortations (1:13b-2:10, 3:1-2, and 3:9a &10) and are followed by sections of explanation or motivation, often providing the theological undergirding for the instruction

(2:11-14, 3:3-7, and 3:9b & 11). The two sections that make up the majority of the body also include a concluding summary exhortation (2:15 and 3:8). In these sections of exhortation and explanation, there is usually supporting material giving the purpose or reason for the preceding statement.

The syntactical thrust of the letter is centered on instructions and exhortations that Paul gives to Titus. These sections begin with 2nd person singular imperative verb forms. As such, the

---

commands in the letter are directed specifically to Titus as opposed to the congregations with him in Crete. Thus the letter’s structure appears to be that of hortatory discourse with command forms being structurally dominant. As stated by David L. Allen, “Hortatory discourse would have command forms (imperatives, etc.) at the apex of the verb cline, while participial and nominal clauses would be backgrounded.”

These imperative commands are followed by sections of indicative verbs, giving motivation and explanation for the stated command. The sections of imperatives and indicatives are usually separated by the conjunction γὰρ (“for”). According to the New Testament linguist Stephen H. Levinsohn, “γὰρ introduces background material that strengthens some aspect of what has just been presented” and “provides explanations or expositions of the previous assertion.” These sections of explanation are thus semantically subordinate to the dominant imperatives. Whether or not these motivational sections provide the necessary impetus, the commands still stand as valid and important instructions.

In both of these sections, phrases often appear that give the purpose or reason for the imperative command or indicative statement. These phrases most often begin with ἵνα (“that/in order that”). In many cases these purpose clauses are the most subordinated syntactical elements, and yet carry much of the semantic weight in the overall thrust of the letter.

The two major sections composing the majority of the letter’s body end with concluding summary exhortations. Titus 2:15 summarizes and restates the commands of 1:13a through 2:14 and 3:8 reemphasizes the commands of 3:1-7. Both of these verses mark a syntactic boundary by including an anaphoric reference to what has just been explained.

---

4 Allen, 80.
6 Ibid., 91.
Structural Outline
A high-level outline of the letter to Titus, highlighting certain syntactical boundary markers and structural elements, would appear as follows. (For verse information, see footnotes 7 and 8).

1) 1:1-4 – Opening
2) 1:5-13a – Past reminder of Titus’ assignment in Crete
   a) 1:10-13a (Recalling details of assignment and providing motivation for following exhortation)
3) 1:13b-2:15 – Exhortation with Explanation/Motivation and Summary Command
   a) 1:13b-2:10 – Exhortation
      i) 1:13b – Exhortation: δι' ἂν αἰτίαιν ἔλεγχε αὐτοὺς ἀποτόμως,
         For this reason rebuke them sharply
         (1) 1:13c – Reason/Purpose: ίνα υγιαίνωσιν ἐν τῇ πίστει,
            so that they may become sound in the faith,
      ii) 2:1 – Exhortation: λάλει ἄνα πρέπει τῇ υγιαίνοισι διδασκαλίᾳ.
         teach what is consistent with sound doctrine.
         (1) 2:5 – Reason/Purpose: ίνα μή ὁ λόγος τοῦ θεοῦ βλασφημηται
            so that the word of God may not be discredited.
      iii) 2:6, 9 – Exhortation: Τοῦς νεανίστους παρακάλει σωφρονεῖν ... δούλους ...
         υποτάσσοσθαι - urge the younger men to be self-controlled ... slaves to be submissive
         (1) 2:8 – Reason/Purpose: ίνα ὁ ἐξ ἔναντιας ἐντραπῇ μηδὲν ἔχων λέγειν περὶ ἡμῶν
            φεύλων - then any opponent will be put to shame, having nothing evil to say of us
         (2) 2:10 – Reason/Purpose: ίνα τὴν διδασκαλίαν τὴν τοῦ σωτήρος ἡμῶν θεοῦ
            κοσμῶσιν ἐν πάσιν - so that in everything they may be an ornament to the
            doctrine of God our Savior
   b) 2:11-14 – Explanation/Motivation: Ἐπεφάνη γὰρ ἡ χάρις τοῦ θεοῦ σωτήρος πάσιν
         ἀνθρώπων παιδεύουσα ἡμᾶς, ... εὐσεβῶς ἐξεσμοῖν - For the grace of God has appeared,
         bringing salvation to all, training us ... to live lives that are ... godly
      i) 2:14 – Theological Reinforcement: ὅς ἔδωκεν ἐκατόν ὑπέρ ἡμῶν, ίνα λυτρώσηται
         ἡμᾶς ἀπὸ πάσης ἀνομίας καὶ καθαρίσῃ ἐκατόν λαὸν περιούσιον, ἔγραψεν - He it is who gave himself for us that he might redeem us from all iniquity
         and purify for himself a people of his own who are zealous for good deeds
   c) 2:15 – Concluding Summary Exhortation: Ταῦτα λάλει καὶ παρακάλει καὶ ἔλεγχε μετὰ
         πάσης ἐπιταγῆς· μηδείς σου περιφρονεῖτω
         Declare these things; exhort and reprove with all authority. Let no one look down on you.

---


8 Unless otherwise noted, the scripture verses contained herein are from the New Revised Standard Version Bible, copyright © 1989 by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., and are used by permission. All rights reserved.
4) 3:1-8 – Exhortation with Explanation/Motivation and Summary Command
   a) 3:1-2 – Exhortation: Ύπομίμησον αὐτούς ἀρχαῖς ἐξουσίαις ὑποτάσσεσθαι … πρὸς πᾶν ἔργον ἀγαθὸν ἔτοιμος εἶναι
      Remind them to be subject to rulers and authorities, … to be ready for every good work
   b) 3:3-7 – Explanation/Motivation: Ἡμεῖς γὰρ ποτε καὶ ἡμεῖς ἁνόητοι, ἀπετιθεῖς, …
      For we ourselves were once foolish, disobedient, …
   i) 3:4-7 – Theological Reinforcement: ἐσώσασαν ἡμᾶς … ἵνα δικαιωθέντες …
      he saved us, … so that, having been justified …, we might become heirs
   c) 3:8 – Concluding Summary Exhortation: καὶ περὶ τῶν βουλόμεν ἐκ διαβεβαιώσατε
      I desire that you insist on these things
   i) 3:8 – Reason/Purpose: ἵνα προσέρχωμαι καὶ προέτασθην, οἱ πεπιστευκότες
      so that those who have come to believe in God may be careful to devote themselves to good works
5) 3:9-11 – Two Exhortations with Explanations
   a) 3:9 First exhortation with explanation
   i) 3:9a – Exhortation: μωράς ἐξετήσεις … περιήστασο
      But avoid stupid controversies
   ii) 3:9b – Explanation/Motivation: εἰςὶν γὰρ ἀνωθελεῖς καὶ μάταιοι
      for they are unprofitable and worthless
   b) 3:10-11 Second exhortation with explanation
   i) 3:10 – Exhortation: αἱρετικὸν ἀνθρωπὸν μετὰ μίαν καὶ δευτέραν νοιθεσίαν
      After a first and second admonition, have nothing more to do with anyone who causes divisions
   ii) 3:11 – Explanation/Motivation: ἴδως ὅτι ἐξέστρατη ὁ τοιοῦτος
      since you know that such a person is perverted
6) 3:12-15 – Closing

Details of the Structure

Past reminder of Titus’ assignment in Crete with Motivation for following Exhortation (1:5-13a)

As mentioned above, the introduction to Titus is set apart from the letter’s body by the transition of verbless material to an explicit verb. Thus the first section of the body starts in Titus 1:5 with the occurrence of the first finite verb in an independent clause. Furthermore, the phrase in verse 5, τοῦτον χάριν (“this reason”), is cataphoric in nature; in the following sentences Paul explains what “this reason” is. The semantic boundary to this section is finally set in verse 13 with the anaphoric use of αὕτη (“this”), which refers to the material just mentioned.

---

The segment of explanation in the second part of this section is set apart by the presence of the conjunction γὰρ (“for”) in verse 10. The material in 1:10-13a serves as a motivation and background for the forthcoming instructions in 1:13b.

**Exhortation with Explanation/Motivation and Summary (1:13b-2:15) – First Major Section**

The first imperative verb in the book appears in Titus 1:13 (ἐγκαίνια, “rebuke”). This change in verbal mood acts as another obvious semantic boundary marker\(^{10}\) and clearly begins the first section of exhortation in the book. This also sets it apart from the previous section, which was characterized by indicative verbs. The reason for this command to rebuke has already been introduced in the preceding paragraph, namely the base character of the Cretans, who are insubordinate, deceivers (1:10), and liars (1:12) who need to be silenced (1:11). These insubordinate ones need to be rebuked rather than taught or reasoned with.

Another imperative verb is found in 2:1 where Titus is told to teach (λαλέω) sound doctrine to the older men and women in the church. So not only is there a new explicit imperative command, there is also a change in audience, which creates another obvious semantic boundary. This section also opens with the emphatic words, Σὺ δὲ (“but you”), setting it apart from the last imperatival instruction and creating a stark contrast with the teaching and lives of the insubordinate ones mentioned in the previous verse.\(^{11}\)

The third and final imperative in this section of the body is found in 2:6. Paul turns his attention to the instructions that Titus is to give to Christian young men and slaves. As with the last explicit imperative, again there is a semantic boundary created by a change of audience. When comparing this verb παρακάλεω (“urge”) to the one in 2:1 (λαλέω, “teach”), rather than new

\(^{10}\) Cf. Levinsohn, 279.
\(^{11}\) Cf. Clark, 109.
instructions for Titus, it could be thought of as simply “narrowing from a more generic verb to a more specific one.”

Throughout the letter, each imperatival section has a corresponding section of explanation or motivation set apart syntactically by the conjunction ὑπὸ (“for”) and characterized by indicative verb forms. In this section (1:13b-2:15), the explanation comes after the three imperatival sections and operates to provide the theological motivation for believers receiving the sound doctrine of the faith being taught by Titus.

It is interesting to note that both of the areas of explanation in the major sections of the letter body (2:11-14 and 3:3-7) contain the most theologically significant material in the letter. They remind the believers of their former lives without God and explain God’s grace to provide salvation for them in Christ Jesus. The ἵνα clauses in these sections operate to reveal the intended outcome of God provision of salvation and thus provide the spiritual motivation for the previous exhortations. The United Bible Societies translation consultant, David Clark, says “it provides a strongly theological rational for the preceding ethical exhortations.”

As mentioned above, most sections of exhortation throughout the letter include a ἵνα clause that indicate the purpose or reason for the command or statement. These clauses carry important semantic weight and help reveal a central part of the discourse. In this section, each imperatival segment includes its own ἵνα clause. David Clark again notes that “each of the sub-units end with a purpose clause with ἵνα that expresses the spiritual goal behind the ethical instructions.” The purpose for Titus rebuking and teaching contains similar overtones in each section, namely that the believers would embrace the healthy teaching and that their lives would be of such a nature so as to validate the message of the gospel.

---

12 Clark, 109.
13 Ibid., 111.
14 Ibid., 111.
Titus 2:15 concludes this section by summarizing the previous section of commands. All three imperatives from this section (from 1:13b, 2:1, and 2:6) are used again in this one sentence, thus creating a concluding summary exhortation. This verse starts with the word ταῦτα ("these things") which "is anaphoric, and refers back to the whole of 1:13b-2:14."\(^{15}\) Because there is no word showing a transition to another thought, this asyndetic summary statement tends to be more emphatic, thus creating a strong semantic boundary.

**Exhortation with Explanation/Motivation and Summary (3:1-8) – Second Major Section**

The second major imperatival section in the body of the letter is structurally similar to the first one, except that the segment of exhortation is much shorter and the section of exhortation used to provide motivation is comparatively longer. This section starts with an asyndetic exhortation on the heals of the summary command given in 2:15. The exhortation is to ὑπομένω ("remind") them of certain ethical matters.

The audience of the exhortation is stated with the generic pronoun αὐτούς ("them"). Because the summary command refers back to all the different groups of people addressed in the previous section, this pronoun also refers to the same groups, including older men (2:2), older women (2:3), young women (2:4), younger men (2:6), and slaves (2:9). These groups are confirmed to be Christian believers in the summary command for this section (cf. 3:8).

Just like the pattern seen earlier, the section providing explanation and motivation (3:3-8a) begins with the conjunction γὰρ and characterized by indicative verb forms. Again it contains some of the most theologically significant material in the letter and helps provide the spiritual motivation for the preceding exhortation. Couched in terms of the triune God’s role in our salvation, it talks about God’s goodness and mercy in justifying us and making us heirs of eternal life.

\(^{15}\) Ibid., 113.
Like the previous section, this segment ends with a concluding summary command. Paul says, in 3:8b, “I desire that you insist on these things.” Although this phrase does not contain an actual imperative verb form, the language here is “semantically also an imperative, even though it is couched in surrogate form.”\footnote{Ibid., 115. Cf. also Daniel B. Wallace, \textit{Greek Grammar Beyond the Basics: An Exegetical Syntax of the New Testament} (Grand Rapids: Zondervan Publishing House, 1996), 451.} As in 2:15, the earlier summary statement, this section also includes an anaphoric ταῦτα (“these things”), referring to all that has been stated in 3:1-8a.

In contrast to the preceding section, there is no ἵνα clause in this material that modifies the imperative verb. However there is ἵνα clause that provides the reason for this summary command. These things should be ‘insisted upon’ “so that those who have come to believe in God may be careful to devote themselves to good works” (3:8). This statement helps end this section by providing an inclusio with 3:1 where Titus is told to “remind them … to be ready for every good work.”

\textit{Two Exhortations with Explanations (3:9-11)}

Although this last section still contains some of the same elements of exhortation and explanation found throughout the rest of the book, it is a much less structured section. Rather than one long imperatival clause as seen in earlier sections, it contains two very short imperatival instructions. Furthermore, the imperatives in 3:9a and 3:10 do not come at the front of their clauses as they consistently do in previous exhortations. The section also does not include a summary exhortation or supporting purposes clauses.

The first imperative, in 3:9a, follows the pattern seen throughout the first of the letter, in that it is followed by a statement of explanation, set apart by the conjunction γάρ (“for”). However, although the exhortation 3:10 is followed by an explanation in verse 11, it does not contain the customary conjunction γάρ and a finite verb, which are found in every other section of
explanation. Instead it contains the causal adverbial participle εἰδότης ("knowing/since you know"), which is somewhat parallel, but less explicit than using a causal conjunction.

**Semantic Focus – Sound Doctrine and Good Works**

**Charging Titus to Teach Sound Doctrine and Ethical Instructions – Grammatical and Semantic Focus**

The major thrust of the book from a syntactic structure is parenetic in nature; Paul is giving instructions to Titus. Most of these instructions come in the predominant imperatival sections and involve Titus’ responsibility to teach the believers. As a leading figure among the churches on Crete, he is told to rebuke the insubordinate (1:13), to teach men and women (2:1), to urge proper conduct of young men and slaves (2:6), and to remind them all to be subject to authorities (3:1). These instructions to Titus all involve his responsibility to impact their lives by teaching them the ethical instructions and responsibilities of the gospel. Paul’s personal directions to Titus were concerning the need for him to carry out his pastoral ministry of imparting proper doctrine and ethical instructions to the believers. In this regard, the syntactically dominant sections concerning exhortation correspond with the semantically dominant theme for Titus to teach others.

**Character of Life: Sound Speech and Good Works – Grammatically Subordinate Semantic Focus**

However, the other semantically dominant themes tend to be grammatically subordinate to the imperative commands given to Titus. For the most part, the other themes are contained in purposes clauses and other modifying phrases. Being dependent clauses as they are, these clauses and phrases are grammatically subordinate to their corresponding independent clauses containing the primary finite verb. However, in terms of discourse they are semantically more significant since they often show the goal and intended outcome of the independent clause. Thus the strength of Paul’s discourse is not only urging Titus to teach others, but it is focused on the
ethical instructions for the believers to have healthy speech and the necessity of believers’ good works in order to valid the message of the gospel.

The importance of sound doctrine, also referred to as ‘healthy teaching’, is emphasized throughout the letter. Titus’ responsibility is to teach this sound doctrine, which includes strong ethical overtones. The desired outcome is that the believers in Crete would not only understand this healthy teaching, but that it would have an impact on their character. It becomes clear that the instruction for both Titus and the other believers on Crete is that they would know the healthy teaching of the gospel and have lives that exemplify its truth. All believers are to have sound speech. The apostles’ healthy teaching needs to be validated and confirmed by the believers’ sound speech. The following phrases illustrate how this theme appears dominant in much of the letter.

The first imperative in the letter is that Titus should rebuke the insubordinate Cretans. The purpose for this is “so that they may become sound in the faith” (1:13b). The second imperative is for Titus to ‘teach’ (2:1). The substance of what he is to teach is “what is consistent with sound doctrine.” In describing how Titus should carry out the instructions of the third imperative, “urge the younger men to be self-controlled”, Paul says, “in your teaching show integrity … and sound speech that cannot be censured” (2:7-8). Thus this theme is closely related to many of the syntactically dominant imperatives. Even the older women in the church are “to teach what is good” (2:3). The fact that all believers are to speak sound doctrine becomes even more prevailing as it is contrasted to the negative speaking of disobedient people and non-believers. (Cf. 1:10-11; 2:3, 9b; 3:9).

The other dominant theme in the letter is how this healthy teaching needs to be validated and confirmed by the believers’ proper conduct and good works. In dealing with this topic in Titus,
an expert in New Testament textlinguistics, Ernst Wendland, says “the pastoral activities of ‘teaching’ … can never be credible or convincing unless they are explicitly confirmed by one’s own lifestyle.”17 This theme is found both as the actual content of certain instructions and in the purpose clauses for others. The purpose of Titus’ good works and sound speech is so that “any opponent will be put to shame, having nothing evil to say of us” (2:8). Young women are to be taught to be proper wives and mothers “so that the word of God may not be discredited” (2:5). Slaves are to be taught to be trustworthy and respectful so that “so that in everything they may be an ornament to the doctrine of God our Savior” (2:10). The very reason that Jesus Christ “gave himself for us” was so that he might “purify for himself a people of his own who are zealous for good deeds” (2:14). Ernst Wendland additionally says,

Further examination reveals how important this exhortation to ‘do good’ is to the entire epistle, semantically as well as structurally. In fact, it forms the other essential half of the thematic equation that summarizes the pragmatic component of the discourse and serves as the rhetorical-structural ‘backbone’ which gives a sense of overall shape and direction to the message as a whole.18

In the latter part of the letter this theme of performing good works becomes even more prevailing. Part of what Titus is to remind the believers is that they would “be ready for every good work” (3:1). In the concluding exhortation in 3:8, Paul gives the reason for insisting on these things is “so that those who have come to believe in God may be careful to devote themselves to good works” (3:8). It is even more striking when the final instruction in the letter, and the last word before the closing greeting, is “And let (our) people learn to devote themselves to good works” (3:14). This again becomes more conspicuous when it is contrasted to actions of

---


18 Ibid., 342.
non-believers who “profess to know God, but they deny him by their actions. They are … unfit for any good work” (1:16).

Conclusion

It thus becomes evident that Paul’s message to Titus is twofold. The syntactical focus of the book is that Titus is to teach sound doctrine to those living in Crete. However, Titus himself is not only instructed to speak sound doctrine, but to live as an example of what this healthy teaching should produce in a person’s life. His speech should be without reproach and his character should be one of integrity, full of good works (2:7-8). Although Titus’ ethical behavior is syntactically subordinate, semantically it carries as much weight as his responsibility to teach.

The other semantic focus of this letter is the ethical instructions to the believers whom Titus is teaching. The healthy teaching of the apostles should be verified by the character shown in the believers’ lives. In both speech and actions they should “live lives that are self-controlled, upright, and godly” (2:12), devoting “themselves to good works … so that they may not be unproductive” (3:14).
Selected Bibliography


The Discourses on Livy (Italian: Discorsi sopra la prima deca di Tito Livio, literally "Discourses on the First Decade of Titus Livy") is a work of political history and philosophy written in the early 16th century (c. 1517) by the Italian writer and political theorist Niccolò Machiavelli, best known as the author of The Prince. The Discourses were published posthumously with papal privilege in 1531.

Discourse Analysis: Provides an accessible introduction and comprehensive overview of the major approaches and methodological tools used in discourse analysis. Introduces both traditional perspectives on the analysis of texts and spoken discourse as well as more recent approaches that address technologically mediated and multimodal discourse. Genre analysis is today's dominant approach for textual analysis, especially in the ESP learning and teaching profession. Adopting this approach, the present study compares the Introduction chapters of MA theses in ELT (English Language Teaching) written by Thai students to those written by American university students based on the move-step analysis.

DISCOURSES. Upon The First Ten (Books) of Titus Livy. To zanobi buondelmonti and to cosimo rucellai. By. Because in it I have expressed what I know and what I have learned through a long experience and a continuing study of the things of the world. And neither you nor others being able to desire more of me, I have not offered you more. You may well complain of the poverty of my endeavor since these narrations of mine are poor, and of the fallacy of (my) judgment when I deceive myself in many parts of my discussion. Which being so, I do not know which of us should be less obligated to the other, either I to you who have forced me to write that which by myself I would not have written, or you to me.