What Isn’t For Sale?
By Michael J. Sandel | Summer 2013 | Vol. 6, Issue No. 2

For Discussion
1. How did you react to the list of price tags in the article’s opening paragraphs? How has this trend manifested itself in your workplace and your community?
2. Among the list of price tags, which ones made you uncomfortable? Which ones made you curious about trying to profit from them yourself?
3. Is there anything wrong with using your body as a billboard, as long as it’s your choice to do so? If you’re doing it because you are in deep poverty, does this mean you really didn’t have a choice?
4. Where do you draw your own line in response to the question “What can’t money buy?”

**EXTRA! Reading**

**EXTRA! Links**
- EDSITEment, “The Industrial Age in America: Robber Barons and Captains of Industry.” Readings, discussion questions, and classroom resources on the rise of wealth in America and the questions that still apply today: Where do we draw the line between unfair business practices and competition that leads to innovation, investment, and improvement in the standard of living for everyone? Can market forces exert sufficient influence to rein in potentially harmful practices or does government have to intervene? ([http://edsitement.neh.gov/lesson-plan/industrial-age-america-robber-barons-and-captains-industry](http://edsitement.neh.gov/lesson-plan/industrial-age-america-robber-barons-and-captains-industry))

Resources are compiled by author(s) and editorial staff. Any views, findings, conclusions, or recommendations expressed in these materials do not necessarily represent those of the National Endowment for the Humanities or the Oklahoma Humanities Council, its Board of Trustees, staff, or donors.
Beyond Partisanship
Mickey Edwards | Summer 2013 | Vol. 6, Issue No. 2

For Discussion
1. Read George Washington’s “Rules of Civility” [find links to online text below]. Would these rules help legislators today? If you could design your own modern rules of civility for Congress, what would they entail?
2. Give an example from American history in which opposing views in the U.S. Congress made a compromise. How would history have been changed if no compromise had been met?
3. How do media, social interactions, and other personal choices contribute to “myside bias”? As individual citizens, what steps can we take to minimize “myside bias”?
4. Discuss your answers to the author’s questions: Does government spending hurt or harm economic growth? Do relaxed college admissions requirements help or hurt disadvantaged students? After hearing opposing views, are you more or less likely to change your opinion?
5. To encourage cooperation, Benjamin Franklin told the Continental Congress that each member should “doubt a little of his own infallibility.” Do you think your opinions are always right—or, like Franklin, do you accept that you may, at times, be wrong?
6. If you were an elected official, are there issues of public policy on which you would not compromise?

EXTRA! Reading
• Mickey Edwards, The Parties Versus the People: How to Turn Republicans and Democrats into Americans (Yale Univ. Press, 2012). Discusses how the U.S. political system has become dysfunctional and suggests solutions to the negative effects of partisan warfare.
• Daniel B. Klien, “I Was Wrong, and So Are You,” The Atlantic, December 2011. Explains how our political leanings leave us more biased than we think. (http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2011/12/i-was-wrong-and-so-are-you/308713/)
• Jackson Turner Main, Political Parties Before the Constitution (Norton [published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, VA], 1974). Author analyzes national politics by studying the voting patterns of state legislatures in early America. Shows how issues of funding of debts, paper money, and land prices provided a battleground that divided legislators along two “parties” or factions.
• Robert V. Remini, At the Edge of the Precipice: Henry Clay and the Compromise that Saved the Union (Basic Books, 2010). Historian Robert Remini shows how Henry Clay’s recognition of the need for bipartisanship in times of crisis saved the Union. Watch video of Remini discussing the book at a National Archives event: (http://www.booktv.org/Watch/11464/Robert+Remini+19212013+At+the+Edge+of+Precipice+Henry+Clay+and+the+Compromise+that+Saved+the+Union.aspx)

(continued)
**Extra Links**


- **Intelligence Squared U.S.**, Moderator John Donvan. This debate-style program shows civil discourse in action. It is filmed in New York and aired on NPR and PBS stations and as a live webcast. Among many topics, you can listen to a podcast or read a transcript from the April 2013 broadcast of “The GOP Must Seize the Center or Die,” in which Mickey Edwards and David Brooks argue for and Laura Ingraham and Ralph Reed argue against the following motion, as quoted from the show’s transcript [moderator John Donvan speaking]: *The rules say that political parties cannot have power unless they first have our votes, and when they fail to get them, as the Republican Party did in sufficient numbers in the race to the White House in 2012, it inevitably sets off soul searching within the party. How did we fail to connect to the American voter? Do we need to change to do better next time? That is the debate that’s taking place right now inside the Republican Party, and we are bringing it out now onto this stage. Yes or no to this statement, “The GOP must seize the center or die,” a debate from Intelligence Squared, U.S. ([http://www.intelligencesquaredus.org/debates/upcoming-debates/item/801-the-gop-must-seize-the-center-or-die](http://www.intelligencesquaredus.org/debates/upcoming-debates/item/801-the-gop-must-seize-the-center-or-die))


- **Museum of the Moving Image**: ([http://www.livingroomcandidate.org/](http://www.livingroomcandidate.org/)). *The Living Room Candidate: Presidential Campaign Commercials 1952-2012* is an online exhibition presenting more than 300 television commercials from every election year since 1952, when the first campaign TV ads aired. Includes a searchable database, commentary, historical background, election results, and navigation organized by year, type of ad, and issue. Includes links to online resources and lesson plans.

Resources are compiled by author(s) and editorial staff. Any views, findings, conclusions, or recommendations expressed in these materials do not necessarily represent those of the National Endowment for the Humanities or the Oklahoma Humanities Council, its Board of Trustees, staff, or donors.
One’s Self I Sing: Writing the American Spirit
By Lori Lindsey | Summer 2013 | Vol. 6, Issue No. 2

For Discussion
1. Discuss other authors you have read (besides Emerson, Whitman, Twain, Hemingway, and Kerouac) that convey the themes of American individualism and self-reliance in their work. Compare and contrast the writing styles and philosophies with the five authors mentioned in Lori Lindsey’s article.
2. Which author(s), if writing today, would be a smash hit in contemporary American? What elements of their ideas, writing, or persona translate to modern American society?
3. Are the themes of individualism and self-reliance uniquely American—or do other cultures also value these ideals? Discuss the similarities and differences in how cultures express these characteristics.
4. What are the outcomes (the strengths and weaknesses) of our nation’s ideals regarding self-reliance and individualism? Do they contribute to the common good?
5. In the nineteenth century, the lack of instantaneous mass communication, geography, and poor transportation forced people to be self-reliant. What factors contribute to self-reliance and individualism today?

EXTRA! Reading
- Henry Steele Commager, The American Mind: An Interpretation of American Thought and Character Since the 1880’s (Yale Univ. Press, 1959). Selected by the Organization of American Historians as one of the ten most significant works published in American history during the decade of the 1950s.
- Eric Foner and John A. Garraty, eds., The Reader’s Companion to American History (Houghton Mifflin, 1991). A portrait of the United States, from the origins of its native peoples to the nation’s complex identity in the 1990s; covers social history, critical events, issues, and individuals that have shaped our past.

EXTRA! Links
- Library of Congress: Search the Digital Collections (http://www.loc.gov/library/libarch-digital.html) and Teachers pages (http://www.loc.gov/teachers/index.html) of this rich national treasure for access to photos, historical documents, readings, lesson plans, and other links. Just enter your selected topic, person, time period, etc. in the search box.
- National Archives: Archival Research Catalog (ARC) (http://www.archives.gov/research/arc/). View photos and historical documents that span our nation’s history. Click the yellow “ARC Search” box on the left side of the page, which will take you to the search page; next, click the “Digital Copies” button at the top of the page, then enter your topic, person, place, etc. in the Search box.

(continued)
Ralph Waldo Emerson
- American Transcendentalism Web, Virginia Commonwealth University: Biography and annotated readings, online texts of Emerson’s work, and commentary and criticism on those works. (http://transcendentalism-legacy.tamu.edu/authors/emerson/index.html)

Walt Whitman
- The Walt Whitman Archive (http://www.whitmanarchive.org/about/index.html), University of Nebraska-Lincoln. Comprehensive collection of Whitman’s manuscripts, published writing, and letters; draws from libraries and collections around the world.
- Revising Himself: Walt Whitman and Leaves of Grass. This Library of Congress exhibit examines Whitman’s life and work with photos, manuscripts, diary pages, and artifacts. (http://www.loc.gov/exhibits/treasures/whitman-home.html)

Mark Twain
- EDSITEment (http://edsitement.neh.gov/): Enter “Mark Twain” in the search box to find links to lesson plans, readings, and websites.
- Mark Twain in His Times (http://twain.lib.virginia.edu/): website directed by Stephen Railton, University of Virginia. An interpretive archive, drawn largely from the resources of the Barrett Collection; contains texts and manuscripts, contemporary reviews and articles, images, and interactive exhibits.

Ernest Hemingway
- PBS, “Michael Palin’s Hemingway Adventure” (http://www.pbs.org/hemingwayadventure/index.html). Online exhibit drawn from the original broadcast series; features readings, lesson plans, bibliography, and links.
- John F. Kennedy Presidential Library (http://www.jfklibrary.org/): Enter “Ernest Hemingway” in the search box to view hundreds of digitized photos from the Ernest Hemingway Collection.

Jack Kerouac
- The Jack Kerouac Archive at The New York Public Library: Three-minute video on Kerouac (http://www.nypl.org/audiovideo/jack-kerouac-archive)
- NPR, Present at the Creation series, “Kerouac’s On The Road.” Correspondent Renee Montagne explores the story behind the novel’s creation. Features audio and video clips and links to web resources. (http://www.npr.org/programs/morning/features/patc/ontheroad/#tapes)

Resources are compiled by author(s) and editorial staff. Any views, findings, conclusions, or recommendations expressed in these materials do not necessarily represent those of the National Endowment for the Humanities or the Oklahoma Humanities Council, its Board of Trustees, staff, or donors.
Civil Discourse in a Divided America
By Scott Gelfand | Summer 2013 | Vol. 6, Issue No. 2

For Discussion
1. How would you define “civil discourse”? What atmosphere, ethics, ideals, etc. are necessary to achieve civil discourse?
2. What were your views on affirmative action before reading Scott Gelfand’s article? Did his presentation of arguments change your thinking? Did he convince you that people on both sides of an issue can embrace the same moral principles?
3. Discuss other actions in our country’s history that state and federal government have taken to serve “the common good.” What were the long-term results of those actions?

EXTRA! Reading
• Peter Gilbert, “Doubt and Conviction,” I Was Thinking ... Travels in the World of Ideas (Wind Ridge Publishing, 2012). The author has generously provided free access to this essay [attached below].
• Judith Rodin and Stephen P. Steinberg, Eds., Public Discourse in America: Conversation and Community in the Twenty-First Century (Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2003). Contributors consider whether rationality is the best standard for public discussion and argument, and isolate features that characterize an exemplary, more productive public discourse. Examines why public conversations work when they work well, and why they often fail when we need them the most.
• Henry David Thoreau, “Civil Disobedience.” EDSITEment (www.edsitement.neh.gov) has selected excerpts from “Civil Disobedience” and discussion questions to guide readers through Thoreau’s arguments. (http://edsitement.neh.gov/launchpad-henry-david-thoreauss-essay-civil-disobedience)

EXTRA! Links
• Institute for Civic Discourse and Democracy (http://icdd.k-state.edu/primarytexts): Primary Texts page links to texts from political leaders, authors, and philosophers collected for the Institute’s class entitled Dialogue on Democracy.
• FREEDOM.OU.EDU: website of the Institute for the American Constitutional Heritage at the University of Oklahoma. Freedom 101 is an ongoing series of video explorations into American constitutional law and history. In Episode 4: Equal Protection: Affirmative Action, Dr. Lindsay Roberts explains the recent history of the 14th Amendment’s Equal Protection Clause as it applies to affirmative action. (http://freedom.ou.edu/lindsay-robertson-equal-protection-affirmative-action/)
• Teaching Tolerance: “Civil Discourse in the Classroom and Beyond.” Activities, worksheets, and readings explore dissent, discussion, and debate. Teaches students to turn unsubstantiated opinions into reasoned arguments and how to apply these skills in a variety of situations. Meets language arts, social studies, and life skills standards. PDF booklet may be downloaded. (http://www.tolerance.org/publication/civil-discourse-classroom)
National Issues Forums (http://www.nifi.org/educators/index.aspx): Under the “Educators” tab you’ll find free readings, PowerPoint presentations, discussion questions, and lesson plans. Resources are equally relevant for community adult discussions and classroom use. Topics include: how to convene and moderate forums, and how to frame issues for productive civil discourse. Specific issues include: (1) “Working Through Difficult Decisions”; (2) “God and the Commons: Does Religion Matter,” which discusses the role of religion in public life; and (3) “Slavery or Freedom Forever: An Historical Issue Framing,” which illustrates the deliberative process using the frame of the 1854 Kansas-Nebraska Act, which determined the fate of slavery in U.S. territories.

PLATO (Philosophy Learning and Teaching Organization): Links to videos, radio podcasts, and readings on philosophy, ethics, and issues. (http://plato-apa.org/)

EXTRA! FOOD FOR THOUGHT
Doubt and Conviction
By Peter Gilbert

The critical balance between conviction and doubt in today’s volatile world

The intolerance of extremism is running rampant. It’s not just Al Qaeda. It’s murders of doctors at abortion clinics. It’s Timothy McVeigh, who saw himself as a modern-day John Brown and thought his attack on the Federal Building in Oklahoma City would inspire others to do likewise. It’s in the Middle East, and so many other places. You can see it in the total confidence that some people at both extremes of political or ideological spectrums have in the rightness of their views, confidence that can become self-righteousness. Perhaps it was ever thus.

Robert F. Kennedy observed that “[w]hat is dangerous about extremists is not that they are extreme but that they are intolerant.” That dangerous intolerance comes from their utter confidence in their means and ends.

In May of 1944, in the midst of World War II, New York City celebrated “I am an American Day” with speeches in Central Park. One speaker was Judge Learned Hand, a jurist so eminent that many called him the tenth Supreme Court Justice. He said, “The spirit of liberty is the spirit which is not too sure that it is right; the spirit of liberty is the spirit which seeks to understand the mind of other men and women … which weighs their interests alongside its own without bias …”

How do we teach our children to have the courage of their convictions on the one hand, and, at the same time, to keep open to the possibility that they may be wrong? That is a difficult, even metaphysical, challenge.

You see that mindset in Abraham Lincoln. Lincoln was deeply, profoundly convinced that slavery was wrong and that the Union must be saved, and he gave his all for the cause. And yet he knew that the South, too, saw its cause as right. He does not judge the South. “It may seem strange,” Lincoln observed in his second inaugural address, “that any men should dare to ask a just God’s assistance in wringing their bread from the sweat of other men’s faces, but let us judge not, that we be not judged.”

Despite this uncertainty, Lincoln concludes that the North should pursue the war to a successful conclusion: “[W]ith firmness in the right, as God gives us to see the right, let us strive on to finish the work we are in....” Lincoln was a great president and great man because while wholly dedicated to his cause, he retained his humility.

The real world is not an ivory tower ethics seminar; it requires decisions—actions and reactions—often when there are no good choices. The challenge is to act out of one’s deeply held convictions but not to lose that speck of humility—of doubt—that checks our intolerance, keeps us open to others’ points of view, deters us from dehumanizing our enemies, and guards us against overstepping.


Resources are compiled by author(s) and editorial staff. Any views, findings, conclusions, or recommendations expressed in these materials do not necessarily represent those of the National Endowment for the Humanities or the Oklahoma Humanities Council, its Board of Trustees, staff, or donors.
What Isn’t for Sale? Citation: Sandel Michael J. 4/2012. “What Isn’t for Sale?“ The Atlantic. Publisher’s Version. Virtually everything is for sale. Modern life has been commodified. The article goes on to say that this pervasive market culture is unfair to those with less money - a fact the Occupy movement has been highlighting - because it makes even basic goods and services more difficult to attain. Where do we draw the line between what is for sale and what is not? As a society, we can’t sell sex but you can buy an egg or sperm. You can’t sell or use drugs but you can get paid to volunteer for pharmaceutical drug trials or scientific experiments.